

REBELLIOUS ARCHITECTURE: MOVEMENT, SUBVERSION AND TRANSUBSTANTIATION IN THE VISIONARY MODE*

ARQUITECTURA INSURGENTE: MOVIMIENTO, SUBVERSIÓN Y TRANSUBSTANCIACIÓN EN EL MODO VISIONARIO

ROCÍO SÁNCHEZ AMEIJERAS
Universidade de Santiago de Compostela
mdelrocio.sanchez@usc.es

ABSTRACT

Years ago, Madeline H. Caviness defined the visionary mode as a distinct mode of expression characterized by a preference for geometric forms, for compositions highly ordered and hierarchical where disorder, as embodied in the contorted figures that inhabit Hell in Last Judgement portals, fitted in with an aesthetic of contrast. What I want to contend here, focusing on the aesthetics of movement and subversion which permeates Romanesque and Early Gothic visionary discourses, is that visionary imagery rebels, more than occasionally, against the “Divine Order”. Formal devices envisioned to perceive an illusory movement, designs intended to evoke the transubstantiation of matter and imagery decorating architectonic elements that make them figuratively rebel against their function animate capitals, columns, arches, ribs and bosses in the three-dimensional scenario that is the medieval west end of Santiago cathedral, in such a way that they seem to challenge well-established traditions. But Compostela is the results of earlier experiences carried out in the portal of Saint-Pierre of Moissac, on the bosses of La Madeleine de Vézelay, or on painted vaults like those of Saint-Chef et Saint-Théodéren-Dauphiné and San Pietro al Monte in Civate, in Lombardy.

* I have earlier delved into the issue of the subversion of the architectonic symbolism in the west end of the cathedral of Santiago de Compostela in the paper “From Compostela’s Ecstatic Glory to Ourense’s Agonic Paradise” in the conference entitled *Gothic Architecture in Spain: Invention and Imitation* (London, The Courtauld Institute of Art, 16th March, 2017). I want to express my gratitude to Rose Walker, Tom Nickson, Paul Binski, Javier Alonso, Ana Suárez, Herbert Kessler, Elisabeth Tayler, Alejandro García Avilés, Gerardo Boto and Francisco Prado-Vilar for their inspiring suggestions and comments. I also want to thank Ramón Yzquierdo Peiró and the Fundación Catedral de Santiago for kindly providing me with images of the Pórtico de la Gloria recently restored, a restoration sponsored by the Fundación Barrié.

KEYWORDS: Saint-Pierre of Moissac, Pórtico de la Gloria of Santiago de Compostela cathedral, visionary discourses, medieval aesthetics, subversion of architectonic symbolism.

RESUMEN

Hace años Madeline H. Caviness definió el modo visionario como un modo particular de expresión caracterizado por la preferencia por formas geométricas y composiciones altamente jerarquizadas, en las que el desorden, como el que encarnan los condenados en el infierno en las portadas de Juicio Final, responde a una estética del contraste. Lo que propongo aquí, centrándome en el análisis de una estética del movimiento y de la subversión presente en discursos visionarios románicos y del primer gótico, es que la imaginaria visionaria se rebela, en bastantes ocasiones, contra el “Orden Divino”. La ilusión de movimiento, diseños pensados para evocar la transubstanciación de los materiales y el hecho de decorar elementos arquitectónicos con imágenes que parecen rebelarse contra su función animan capiteles, columnas, arcos, nervios y claves de bóveda en el escenario tridimensional que es el cierre occidental de la catedral compostelana de tal manera que parecen desafiar tradiciones firmemente establecidas. Pero Compostela es el resultado de experiencias anteriores llevadas a cabo en la portada de Saint-Pierre de Moissac, en las claves de bóveda de La Madeleine de Vézelay, o en las bóvedas pintadas de las iglesias de Saint-Chef et Saint-Théodé-en-Dauphiné y San Pietro al Monte in Civate, en Lombardía.

PALABRAS CLAVE: Saint-Pierre de Moissac, Pórtico de la Gloria de la catedral de Santiago de Compostela, discursos visionarios, estética medieval, subversión del simbolismo arquitectónico.

“..In the year that King Ozias died, I saw the Lord sitting upon a throne high and elevated: and his train filled the temple. Upon it stood the seraphims: the one had six wings, and the other had six wings: with two they covered his face, and with two they covered his feet, and with two they flew. And they cried one to another, and said: Holy, holy, holy, the Lord of hosts, all the earth is full of his glory, and the lintels of the doors –*superliminaria*– were moved at the voice of him that cried, and the house was filled with smoke... And one of the seraphims flew to me, and his hand was a live coal, which he had taken with the tongs of the altar. And he touched my mouth, and said: Behold this has touched thy lips, and thy iniquities shall be taken away, and thy sin shall be cleansed” (Isaiah, 6, 1-8).¹

So Isaiah described the vision of his epiphany and his vocation. He saw, then, the *superliminaria* of the temple moving at the voice of Him that cried. I recall hearing Serafín Moralejo relate the term *superliminaria* incised in the inscription of one of the lintels of the main entrance of the Pórtico de la Gloria of Compostela cathedral (Fig. 1), to the text of Isaiah, for the Latin word was not the usual one for describing lintels in medieval and early modern times. And the relationship between the Prophet’s vision and the Portico’s lintel is visually enhanced both by the location of his figure next to the written word and by the presence of the seraphim in the counterfaçade of the porch, from where they contemplate the enthroned

¹ I am quoting from the Douay-Rheims Bible.



Fig. 1. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. Pórtico de la Gloria. Detail. Lintel (Photo: Ignacio Mascuñán)

Lord transformed into the enormous Christ presiding over the tympanum (Fig. 2).² As if the inscription were prophetic, one of the lintels broke when the portal was erected.

Isaiah's vision, which deals with prophetic architecture, with emotional, unstable, moving architecture, provides us with an appropriate beginning for delving into the aesthetics of movement and subversion which permeates Romanesque and Early Gothic visionary discourses. Years ago, in her two classic studies on medieval modes of seeing, Madeline H. Caviness had defined the visionary mode as a distinct manner of medieval expression characterized by a preference for geometric forms, for compositions highly ordered and hierarchical, where disorder, as embodied in the contorted figures that inhabit Hell in Last Judgement portals, is conceived within the frame of an aesthetics of contrast.³ What I want to contend here is that visionary imagery rebels, more than occasionally, against the "Divine Order". Formal devices envisioned to perceive an illusory movement, designs intended to evoke the transubstantiation of matter and imagery decorating architectonic elements that make them figuratively rebel against their function animate capitals, columns, arches, ribs and bosses in the three-dimensional scenario that is the medieval west end of Santiago de Compostela's cathedral. There, earlier experiences were refashioned, like those carried out in the portals of Saint-Pierre of Beaulieu-sur-Dordogne, of Sainte-Marie of Souillac or Saint-Pierre of Moissac, on the bosses of the abbey church of La Madeleine of Vézelay, or on painted vaults like those of the churches of Saint-Chef et Saint-Théodère-en-Dauphiné and San Pietro al Monte in Civate, in Lombardy.

If, at Compostela, the threshold of the Temple moved only metaphorically, perhaps the prophecy of Isaiah could inspire the design of other visionary portals. In fact, in medieval and

² On the Christological interpretation of the biblical passage see the indispensable H. KESSLER, *Spiritual Seeing. Picturing God's Invisibility in Medieval Art*, Philadelphia, 2000, pp. 54-55.

³ M. H. CAVINESS, "Images of Divine Order and the Third Mode of Seeing," *Gesta* 22/2 (1983), pp. 99-119; Eadem, "The Simple Perception of Matter' and the Representation of Narrative, ca. 1180-1280," *Gesta*, 30 (1991), pp. 48-64. H. KESSLER, *Spiritual Seeing*, *passim* focuses on the third mode mostly as a figurative or typological way of seeing.



Fig. 2. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. Pórtico de la Gloria.

(Photo: Pixi Arnoso. © Fundación Barrié y Fundación Catedral)

modern times the word *superliminaria* was usually translated into vernacular languages with terms alluding to the vertical supports of an entrance, not to its horizontal crowning. In the 14th and 15th Castilian *Bíblas romanceadas* it was turned into *los estantes de los pilares*, *los quiciales de los umbrales* or *los cobdillos de los vnbrales*;⁴ in the French Bibles moralisées it was interpreted as *les chambrantes*, *cherniers*, *chamvreres*, and it was decoded as “posts” in the King James’ Bible. Despite the differences, all the translations allude to vertical supports of the entrance of a building, and so do the visual interpretations of the passage in illuminated Bibles. Unfortunately, I was unable to find images of shivering posts in Romanesque bibles, probably because they are much in debt to the Byzantine formula which stresses the narrative related to Isaiah’s visual and tactile perception, omitting any architectonic reference. In the Vatican manuscript of the *Christian Topography* of Cosmas Indicopleustes (Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS gr. 699, fol. 72v),

Christ seats flanked by a couple of stationary, flat and disembodied seraphim -their bodies made of vivid colourful wings, not with flesh, while one of them, incarnated in a human body, stride toward Isaiah in a lively manner, to insert the coal into the Prophet’s mouth.⁵

⁴ The different versions are gathered together in the web page of the research project *biblia medieval*, www.bibliamedieval.es.

⁵ G. PEERS, *Subtle Bodies. Representing Angels in Byzantium*, Berkeley, Los Angeles, London, 2001, pp. 52-5, who is interested in the representation of the angels’ changing nature. On the visual Christological basis of this image, KESSLER, *Spiritual Seeing*, pp. 54-5.



Fig. 3. Bible moralisée (BnF, MS fr. 167, fol. 165v). (© Bibliothèque nationale de France). The shivering Temple of Isaiah's vision

Although this model was emulated in Western illustrations of the biblical passage, for example, in the Roda Bible (Biblia Sancti Petri Rotensis, BnF, MS lat. 6 (3), fol. 2v),⁶ in other instances the text was visually abridged with a simple allusion to the enthroned Lord flanked by the seraphim.⁷

The luxuriant figurative generosity of the Bibles Moralisées, favoured, instead, the possibility of envisioning trembling thresholds of the Temple on the surface of parchment. In the Oxford/London/Paris Bible (Paris, BnF, MS lat. 11560, fol. 106v), the *vox clamantis* turned into the sound of a trumpet blown by an angel makes the Temple collapse, exposing the *ciborium* of the altar.⁸ But the noticeable size of the casements of the door rendered in the very first plane suggests that the disaster finds its origins in the jamb's imbalance. Another angel blows his trumpet, now against the crowning of the building, in the *Bible Moralisée* of Jean le Bon, dated to the mid-fourteenth century, (BnF, MS fr. 15397, fol. 165r)⁹. More conspicuous is the formula used in the exemplar commanded by Philippe Le Hardi in the fifteenth century (BnF, MS fr. 167, fol. 165v) (Fig. 3). Undulating broken lines overlap the frame of the Temple's door; these lines symbolizing at the same time their shivering *chamvres*/*chambrantes* and

⁶ On Isaiah in the Middle Ages, B. G. BUCUR, *Scripture Re-envisioned: Christophanic Exegesis and the Making of the Christian Bible*, Leyden, 2018, esp. chap. 6: "Isaiah Saw His Glory: Re-Envisioning prophetic Visions".

⁷ Other examples in Bibliothèque de la Chambre des Députés, MS 2, fol. 1103v; and Lyons, Bibliothèque Municipale MSS 410-411, fol. 69. See W. CAHN, *Romanesque Manuscripts. The Twelfth Century*, London, 1996, 2 vols, II, pp. 26-7, and p. 65.

⁸ On this Bible, J. LOWDEN, *The Making of the Bibles Moralisées*, University Park, 2000, 2 vols., I, pp. 95-137.

⁹ See F. AVRIL, "Un chef d'œuvre de l'enluminure sous le règne de Jean le Bon: la Bible moralisée, manuscrit français 167 de la Bibliothèque nationale," *Fondation Eugène Piot, monuments et mémoire publiés par l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres*, Paris, 1972, pp. 91-125.

la fumée that invaded the interior of the building.¹⁰ Thus, apparently, a formal convention to represent shivering architectures on the surface of the parchment did not exist in the Middle Ages. Nevertheless, it is possible that other attempts were fashioned on more solid three-dimensional stone compositions.

Isaiah's vision helps to explain certain peculiarities of the south portal of the church of Saint-Pierre of Moissac, dated by Ilene Forsyth between 1000 and 1115,¹¹ where an impressive visionary discourse is embodied in elegant, slender and moving forms (Fig. 4). I refer, especially, to the arresting design of the scallop profiles of its jambs, which echoes in the trumeau where it is softened.

From the mid twentieth century, art historians interested in Moissac tiptoed around the uncomfortable issue of the portal's jambs. More precisely, they ignored them. They shifted the focus from the tympanum to the structure of the ensemble, and then to the narrative reliefs carved on the lateral walls of the porch, only to come, back, eventually, to the ensemble again. Following the successive vogues of the discipline, they moved from analysis of visionary iconography, to that of its historical/sociological background, to narratology, to the discussion of the conceptual dimension of the representation of the body or to the study of the relationship between imagery and liturgy. Yet, Yves Christe, Nouredinne Mezoughi, Linda Seidel, Jochen Zinc, Peter Klein, Piotr Skubiszewski, Ilene H. Forsyth, Thomas Dale, Marcello Angehen and Barbara Franzé hardly ever stopped at the jambs.¹² Perhaps, because the jambs of the portal of Moissac are, trully, bizarre and intriguing.

So Joan Evans must have thought who, in her compendium on Romanesque art of the Cluniac order published in 1950 tried to tame the energetic profiles. Being aware of the preference for polylobed arches in Cluniac Romanesque churches she included the Moissac

¹⁰ N. FLIEGEL, S. JUGIE and V. BARTHÉLEMY, *L'Art à la Cour de Bourgogne: Le Mécénat de Philippe le Hardi et de Jean sans Peur, 1364-1419*, Paris, 2004, p. 496.

¹¹ I. H. FORSYTH, "Narrative at Moissac: Schapiro's Legacy," *Gesta*, 41/2 (2002), pp. 71-93; EADEM, "The Date of the Moissac Portal" in R.A. MAXWELL and K. AMBROSE (eds.), *Current Directions in Eleventh- and Twelfth-Century Sculpture Studies*, Turnhout, 2010, pp. 61-76.

¹² Y. CHRISTE, *Les grands portails romans*, Genève, 1969, pp. 25-55; N. MEZOUGH, "Le tympan de Moissac: études d'iconographie," *Les Cahiers de Saint-Michel de Cuxa*, 9 (1978), pp. 171-200; L. SEIDEL, "Images of Crusaders in Western Art: Models as Metaphors," in V.P. GROSS and Ch. VERZAR BORNSTEIN (eds.), *The Making of the Two Worlds. Exchange between East and West during the Period of the Crusades*, Kalamazoo, 1986, pp. 377-91; J. ZINK, "Moissac, Beaulieu, Charlieu: Zur Ikonologischen Kohärenz romanischer Skulpturenprogramme im Südwesten Frankreichs und in Burgund," *Aachener Kunstblätter*, 56-57 (1988-1989), pp. 73-182; P. KLEIN, "Programmes schatologiques, fonction et reception historiques des portails du XII^e s.: Moissac-Beaulieu-Saint-Denis," *Cahiers de civilisation médiévale*, 33 (1990), pp. 317-38. P. SKUBISZEWSKI, "Le trumeau et le linteau de Moissac: un cas de symbolism médiéval," *Cahiers archéologiques*, 40 (1992), pp. 51-90; Y. CHRISTE, *L'Apocalypse de Jean. Sens et développements de ses visions synthétiques*, Paris, 1996, pp. 166-70; FORSYTH, "Narrative at Moissac"; EADEM, "The Date of the Portal of Moissac"; T. DALE, "The Nude at Moissac: Vision, Phantasia, and the Experience of Romanesque Sculpture," in R. A. MAXWELL and K. AMBROSE (eds.), *Current Directions in Eleventh- and Twelfth-Century Sculpture Studies*, Turnhout, 2010, pp. 61-76; M. ANGHEBEN, "La Téphanie du portail de Moissac. Une vision de l'Église céleste célébrant la liturgie eucharistique," *Les Cahiers de Saint-Michel de Cuxa*, 45 (2014), pp. 61-82; B. FRANZÉ, "Moissac et l'œuvre de l'abbé Anqustil (1085-115): un discours de pénitence," *Hortus Artium Medievalium*, 12 (2015), pp. 385-405. The titles devoted to the sculpture of Moissac are so numerous that I only cite the more recent ones or those related to the issues discussed here.



Fig. 4. Abbey church of
Saint-Pierre of Moissac.
South portal.
(Photo: Elena Aranda)

design in the wider context of what she considered a “Cluniac architectonic motif”, a mere decorative motif of which the members of the religious Order were fond.¹³ Understanding the scalloped jambs in such a way deprives them of their extraordinary expressive force that had so impressed Meyer Schapiro. In fact, he had already noticed the radical differences between both patterns:

The scalloping of the jambs (...) should be distinguished from the polylobed arches of Romanesque and Islamic art. For whereas the individual scallops of the latter have a clear analogy to the elastic arched form of the whole, the scalloping of the jambs produces a line in active contrast with the rigid verticals of the jambs. It is distinctly more restless, broken form, which an academic clas-

¹³ “Cusping of this kind is sufficiently unusual, and its use sufficiently widely spread within the Order, for it to be a recognizable Cluniac characteristic,” see J. EVANS, *Cluniac Art of the Romanesque Period*, New York, 1950, p. 39.

sicist taste has always found reprehensible in mediaeval art. By the application of such scalloping to a jamb beside a trumeau (less prominently scalloped in Moissac) the doorway becomes an asymmetrical architectural unit without the affirmation of static support inherent in the common lintel-and-post construction. On the contrary, the doorposts in Moissac are animated members, on which the movement is accented by the pleated ribbon meandering on the inner edges. The slender colonnettes engaged to these narrow sides of the jambs are also lobbed and broken, in contradiction of the very nature of the columnar member.¹⁴

Schapiro perceived how the design of the jambs of Moissac contradicts the appearance of stability that architectonic supports are intended to show. In fact, if rectilinear structures strengthen the perception of order and stability, curved profiles convey movement as in the case of S-shaped strigiles, so popular in ancient sarcophagi to evoke moving water.¹⁵ But the broken curves of Moissac diverge notably from undulating strigiles.

If Joan Evans had seen in the scalloped jambs of Moissac “a Cluniac architectonic motif”, Ilene Forsyth considered “the expanding-contracting, divergent-convergent form of the trumeau” as an expression of a “Romanesque entasis”, understanding the broken forms as a Romanesque *stilische Grundbegriffe*.¹⁶ What they did not note is that these broken profiles only appear in visionary portals, in the jambs and trumeau of Moissac, in the *trumeaux* of the portal of the church of Sainte-Marie of Souillac, much altered today, and on the southern portal of the abbey church of Saint-Pierre of Beaulieu-sur-Dordogne.¹⁷ Neither Schapiro nor Forsyth considered that the illusion of movement could bear a semantic weight related to the visionary.¹⁸ But, would those fanciful profiles bring to the mind of the monks of Moissac the shivering posts of the Temple of Isaiah’s vision? May be. The enthroned Lord transfigured into Christ dominates the tympanum speaking with his thunderous voice –as his speaking/blessing hand bear witness, flanked by two seraphim.¹⁹ Indeed, Isaiah is given a place of honor in the façade.

¹⁴ M. SCHAPIRO, “The Romanesque Sculpture of Moissac”. Part I (2), *The Art Bulletin* 13 (1931) pp. 464-531, p. 523, note 137, repr. in SCHAPIRO’s *Selected Papers*, I, *Romanesque Sculpture*, New York, 1977, pp. 137-264.

¹⁵ On the organic character of sigmoid curves, associated with water in Roman strigillated sarcophagi, see J. HUTKINSON, *Roman Strigillated Sarcophagi*, Oxford, 2015, pp. 8-11. On the sigmoid curve in Gothic art, P. BINSKI, “La Línea de la Belleza en el Gótico: motivos y estética medieval,” *Quintana*, 26 (2017), pp. 51-58.

¹⁶ FORSYTH, “Narrative at Moissac,” p. 75.

¹⁷ Unfortunately, the limits of this contribution prevent including the *trumeaux* of Moissac, Souillac and Beaulieu in the discussion on “rebellious architecture”.

¹⁸ On Schapiro’s meagre interest on iconography in his early work on Moissac see FORSYTH, “Narrative at Moissac,” p. 74. On Schapiro’s work, see the special issue of *Social Research* 45 (1978); a survey of his scholarship in P. STIRNEMANN, “Meyer Schapiro as Iconographer,” in C. HOURIHANE (ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Medieval Iconography*, London and New York, 2017, pp. 142-152.

¹⁹ Of course, Isaiah’s vision converges with those of St John in the tympanum, echoing the logic of the composition of the biblical texts, for the vision of the seraphim was refashioned in Rev. 4, 4-8. See esp. CHRISTE, *Les grands portails*, pp. 25-55; MEZOUGH, “Le tympan,” pp. 171-200; ZINK, “Moissac, Beaulieu, Charlieu,” pp. 73-182; KLEIN, “Programmes schatologiques,” pp. 317-338; CHRISTE, *L’Apocalypse de Jean*, pp. 166-170. An 11th century manuscript of Jerome’s Commentary on Isaiah copied at Moissac is still preserved, see J. DUFOUR, *La Bibliothèque et le scriptorium de Moissac*, Genève-Paris, 1972, pp. 116-117. Jerome understands Isaiah 6, 1-8, basically, as a lesson on the triumph of the Christian Church over the Jewish Temple, see HIERONIMUS, *Commentarium In Isaiam Prophetam Libri Duodeviginti* (PL 24, cols. 17-687B, esp. cols. 95-96). I do not aim to identify a precise relationship between the text and the imagery of the portal, but both share a Christological interpretation of Isaiah’s vision.

Only two figures are displayed on the walls flanking the entrance: St Peter, to whom the abbey church was dedicated, and Isaiah whose presence can be explained by the prominent role he plays in the prophetic discourse of the ensemble. At Moissac, Isaiah is given the floor. While the Apostle holds in his hand the keys that identify him, the prophet is pointing towards the prophetic words engraved on the scroll he unrolls: *ECCE VIRGO CONCIPIET* –“Behold a Virgin shall conceive” (Isaiah, 11:1)–, announcing the Incarnation of Christ and directing the eyes of the viewers towards the scene of the Annunciation carved on the lower register of the right wall of the porch. The Incarnation of the Lord is not the only prophecy of Isaiah alluded to there. In the upper register, a frieze decorated with a narrative of Christ’s Infancy ends with the scene of the fall of the idols in Heliopolis that, according to Pseudo-Matthew, had been announced by Isaiah –a prophesy prompted by the satirical description of the manufacture of the idols in Isaiah 44-48–.²⁰ As the Holy Family approaches the Egyptian city and, figuratively, the façade and the entrance of the church of Moissac, the idols –symbolized by extant statues placed on top of the city walls– fall down.

As would be expected, Meyer Schapiro devoted splendid pages to the figures of Isaiah and Saint Peter of Moissac where he threshed out the talented sculptor’s formal repertoire to convey movement as he did with the visionary tympanum, a poetics he understood as being at the service of making visible the Heavenly Glory. But St Peter and Isaiah do not fit in the turmoil that accompanies the impressive vision of the tympanum. They belong to the more common earthly realm. Figures flanking portals appear in a number of Romanesque portals, usually rendered static, frontally, and creating a symmetrical pattern. Nevertheless, the dynamic biblical characters at Moissac show distorted anatomies and they compose a divergent diagram (see again Fig. 4).

The slender figure of St Peter epitomizes a sequential movement. Turning his head in a violent torsion towards Isaiah and amazed by his words –witness the open palm of his “listening hand”– he decides to direct his steps in a hurry to the right side of the entrance, as his floating cloak indicates.²¹ The prophet, on the other hand, tries to move away from the door towards the right side, his floating cloak invading the cusped profile of the jamb and his right leg overlapping the portal’s last colonette.

The centrifugal array of these moving figures flanking the entrance and the importance given to Isaiah’s prophecies in the discourse of the façade suggest that their movement does not merely obey a formal aesthetics close to Modern expressionism as Schapiro judged it. Actually, St Peter and Isaiah do not move. They escape. They escape from the moving *superliminaria* of the Old Testament Temple transformed physically and poetically into those of the Christian church of Moissac.

If at Moissac the jambs, the Prophet and the Apostle of the visionary south portal are agitated, so are the column figures of the embrasures of the visionary ensemble of the Pórtico de la Gloria at Santiago, an enterprise envisaged more than half a century later (Figs. 5a and

²⁰ As brilliantly discussed by FORSYTH in “Narrative at Moissac,” pp. 81-82. The text of Pseudo Mathew, 23: “When Mary and the Child entered all the idols fell, and Isaiah’s word was fulfilled. ‘Behold the Lord shall come upon a light cloud and enter into Egypt, and all the gods made by the hand of the Egyptians shall be moved before his face’”. The full text, in M.R. JAMES, *The Apocryphal New Testament*, Oxford, 1955, p. 75.

²¹ Echoing the gesture of Mary in the Annunciation carved on the northern wall of the porch.



Figs. 5a and 5b. Santiago de Compostela cathedral. Pórtico de la Gloria. Prophets and apostles in the embrasures of the central entrance. (Photo: Denis E. F. © Fundación Catedral de Santiago)

5b). There, the choice of representing Prophets and Apostles on the monolithic columns of the portal's embrasures is anchored, as is well known, in the experiments carried out on the French *portails-royaux*, and, ultimately, on the Pauline metaphors equating Prophets and Apostles with the supports of the spiritual Church (Ephesians 2.19-22).²² But in Compostela, although in the *Liber Sancti Iacobi*, St James is equated with a *firmissima columpna*,²³ most of the metaphorical solid and firm foundations seem to have forgotten their responsibilities. They move. Although St Peter, Moses and Isaiah stand by the jambs of the main entrance, the living characters displayed there are walking and chatting to each other. On the left embrasure, Daniel and Jeremiah are engaged in an amusing informal talk –if we credit the inscriptions of their scrolls they are joking about the stupidity of the pagans who venerate the idols– while setting off on their way towards the exterior of the Temple.²⁴ And on the right side, St Paul, who “turned sharply left”, as the peculiar disposition of his feet and crossed legs convey, is pointing with his left-hand finger towards St James, making visible, with his attitude, the message of the scroll he is holding where it is stated that the Apostle’s words rely upon the prophets’, a discourse on the unbroken transmission of the Word that carries on the text of St James’s scroll, which, curiously enough, it is based on 1, Cor, 3, 3-6.²⁵ St James has just paused in order to address St John, figuratively encouraging him to spread his message. The text written on the book he holds alludes to the New Jerusalem –ET EGO JOHANNES VIDI SANCTAM CIVITATEM, JERUSALEM NOVAM, DESCEDENTEM DE COELO A DEO–²⁶. Thus, “moving” column figures are metaphorically speaking about “moving architecture”.

²² On the artistic consequences of the Pauline metaphor, see M.-L. THÉREL, “Comment la patrologie vient éclairer l’archéologie,” *Cahiers de civilisation médiévale*, 6 (1963), pp. 141-168; B. REUDENBACH, “Säule und Apostel: Überlegungen zum Verhältniss von Architektur und architekturexegetischer Literatur im Mittelalter,” *Frühmittelalterliche Studien*, 14 (1980), pp. 310-315; É. VERGNOLLE, “La colonne à l’époque romane: réminiscences et nouveautés,” *Cahiers de civilisation médiévale*, 41 (1988), pp. 141-174, esp. 145-150. See a comprehensive record of biblical architectonic metaphors in C. RUDOLPH, “Construyendo la casa de Dios. La metáfora arquitectónica y el Arca Mística,” *Codex Aquilarensis*, 31 (2015), pp. 47-67, esp. note 3. On architectonic metaphors as a trope for *inventio*, or its wider use in medieval monastic realms, see the already classic M. CARRUTHERS, *The Craft of Thought: Meditation, Rhetoric, and the Making of Images, 400-1200*, Cambridge, 1998. On architectonic metaphors related to the Virgin Mary see the contribution of Herbert Kessler in this issue.

²³ Serafín Moralejo had noticed the relationship between the architectonic metaphor in the *Liber Sancti Iacobi* equating Saint James with a *firmissima columpna* and the enthroned figure of the saint on the trumeau of the Pórtico, but this example constitutes an exception, see S. MORALEJO ÁLVAREZ, “El Pórtico de la Gloria,” *FMR*, 21 (1993), pp. 28-46, repr. A. FRANCO MATA (ed.), *Patrimonio Artístico de Galicia y otros estudios. Homenaje al Profesor Serafín Moralejo Álvarez*, 3 vols., Santiago de Compostela, 2004, II, pp. 281-284. The literature on the Pórtico is so vast that I will cite only the titles related with the specific questions discussed here.

²⁴ DANIELIS PROPHETE. ECCE ENIM DEVS QVEM COLIMVS (Dan. 3, 7); HIEREMIAS PROPHETA. OPVS ARTIFICIVM VNIVERSA (Iher. 10, 9). For the inscriptions of the scrolls, see R. SILVA COSTOYAS, *El Pórtico de la Gloria. Autor e interpretación*, Santiago, 1999, pp. 199-202, with further bibliography. Although the inscriptions, painted but not incised on the stone, date to the seventeenth or eighteenth centuries, there is no reason to believe that they do not reproduce earlier ones. I want to express my gratitude to Ana Suárez for her comments on their chronology.

²⁵ On the scroll of St Paul it is read: MVLTIFARIAM MVLTISQUE MODIS OLIM DEVS LOQVENS IN PROPHETIS; NOVISSIME (...) LOCVTVS EST NOBIS IN FILIO (Hbr. 1,1). On the one of St. James, DEVS INCREMENTVM DEDIT HAC REGIONE, a free version of 1 Cor 3, 3-6; see SILVA COSTOYAS, *Pórtico*, pp. 201-02.

²⁶ SILVA COSTOYAS, *Pórtico*, p. 202. For its importance in the interpretation of the ensemble, S. MORALEJO ÁLVAREZ, “Le Porche de la Gloire de la Cathédrale de Compostelle: problèmes de sources et d’interprétation,” *Les Cahiers de Saint-Michel de Cuxá*, 16 (1985), pp. 92-116, repr. A. FRANCO MATA (ed.), *Patrimonio Artístico de Galicia y otros*

A parallel –or precedent– for these dynamic column figures is to be found in Early Gothic Northern French experiments, more precisely in the series on the Western portal of Senlis cathedral, dated to 1170, which we know today only through the plaster casts preserved in the Musée des Monuments Français.²⁷ Amongst the static characters that form a typological programme, David is singled out by his movement: he is dancing. The Senlis column figure that could be labelled as a “dancing column” is an exception, and his dance is but an attribute that identifies him –as are the four nails alluding to Psalm 22 and the parchment that he holds. Nevertheless, in Compostela, there is a series of “walking” columns. Most of the figures seem to walk, and their varied movements may evoke, in general terms, the wandering course of the prophets or the fixed routes of the apostolic missions, or perhaps the parade of the protagonists of the *Ordo Prophetarum*, but they do not add any connotation to any individual characterization.²⁸

The imaginary instability of the construction is stressed by the fact that socles seem insecure. The beasts of Daniel’s vision –the bear, the lions, and winged monsters – are literally crushed by the architectural structure bearing down upon them (see Fig. 2; see also Fig. 14b).²⁹ Some of them had already surrendered; others, infuriated, still resist, enjoying their last supper, removing the intestines of the powerful pillars which squash them. In Compostela, I am not sure if the lintels of the door moved metaphorically, but the column figures and socles rebel against their supporting function, against a long running tradition of architectural symbolism which called for appropriate images stressing the illusion of stability and strength in the design of the supporting architectonic elements.

Mateo’s ability to make architectural elements appear to be made of living material by means of their design is also endorsed in the Portico’s torqued marble columns (see Fig. 2). Besides the central *trumeau*, three marble twisted columns stand in the embrasures. Despite being embroidered with dense figurative decoration, both their material and their spiraling design may have been chosen to evoke water. As Fabio Barry has brilliantly analyzed marble was thought in Antiquity and in the Middle Ages to have liquid origins, that it was a sort of frozen sea.³⁰ The liquid connotations that material gave the columns are stressed in Compostela by their spiral design which echoes, ultimately, prestigious Vatican models.³¹ The

estudios. Homenaje al Profesor Serafín Moralejo Álvarez, 3 vols. Santiago de Compostela, 2004, I, pp. 307-318, esp. p. 316.

²⁷ W. SAUERLÄNDER, *La Sculpture Gothique en France 1140-1270*, Paris, 1972, p. 88.

²⁸ Serafín Moralejo proposed the idea that the column figures of the Pórtico could conform the *drammatis personae* of an *Ordo prophetarum* in a publication lacking any critical apparatus, see MORALEJO ÁLVAREZ, “El Pórtico de la Gloria,” esp. pp. 30-38. Afterwards, Manuel Castiñeiras developed the idea in several publications, the more recent being M. CASTIÑEIRAS GONZÁLEZ, “La iglesia del Paraíso: el Pórtico de la Gloria como puerta del Cielo,” in R. IZQUIERDO PEIRÓ (ed.), *Maestro Mateo en el Museo del Prado*, Madrid, 2016, pp. 53-83, esp. pp. 73-75, where he refers to his earlier works. Nevertheless, the question remains open.

²⁹ For the identification of Daniel’s visions in the Pórtico, M. A. CASTIÑEIRAS GONZÁLEZ, “A poética das marxes no románico galego: bestiario, fábulas e mundo ó revés,” *Semata*, 14 (2002), pp. 293-334, esp. pp. 294-95.

³⁰ F. BARRY, “Walking on Water: Cosmic Floors in Antiquity and the Middle Ages,” *Art Bulletin*, 89 (2007), pp. 627-56; Id., *Painting in Stone: The Symbolism of Colored Marbles in the Visual Arts and Literature from Antiquity until the Enlightenment*, Ph. Diss., Columbia University Academic Commons, 2011.

³¹ On the Vatican columns, D. KINNEY, “Spolia,” in W. TRONZO (ed.), *Saint Peter’s in the Vatican*, New York, 2005, pp. 16-47; B. NOBILONI, “Le colonne vitinee della Basilica di San Pietro a Roma,” *Xenia Antiqua*, 6 (1997), pp. 81-142.

intermediate step in this journey is to be found in Compostela itself, in the marble columns which once adorned the Romanesque north portal of the church, whose mutilated shafts are now preserved in the Museo de la Catedral. If in one of them, the episode of Ulysses and the Sirens is fashioned with boats, sailors, sirens, Scylla, serpents and other inhabitants of the sea, now turned into marble, on the other ones, *putti*, vines and grapes figuratively turn the stone into wine, as in their Vatican relatives, echoing, physically, the Eucharistic transubstantiation.³²

The rebellious columns and socles or the dissolving marble columns of the Pórtico de la Gloria demonstrates that master Mateo –the alleged *concepteur*– and his entourage were well aware of the figurative metaphors associated with architectural elements, but they also announce their intention to expand their expressive possibilities by trying out new formulae that challenged well-established traditions. The most astonishing singularity of Mateo's architectonic imagination is the way he designed a visionary figurative discourse on the alteration of the natural order by altering the artificial order, i. e., by subverting the symbolism associated with the architectonic components of a building not only in the Pórtico but in the whole west end of the cathedral.

As is well-known, the lower level of its three story structure, known as the crypt, was linked by a monumental staircase to the middle level, conceived as part of an open and permeable space, with its own balcony facing West; the structure was crowned by a tribune (Fig. 6).³³ The Pórtico's open character is consistent with another singularity of the design of the façade: the proliferation of windows. The wall above the lateral entrances of the Pórtico is pierced by two oculi, and a huge rose window with small oculi accenting the square upper segment of the façade lights the tribune. The resulting ensemble displays an outwardly homogeneous design and, in the interior, a clearly articulated figural programme that links all three storeys together in one argument: the cosmic revolution, the alteration of the natural order which precedes and announces the End of Time and the Coming of a New Order.

³² On the "Ulysses column," F. PRADO-VILAR, "Nostos: Ulises, Compostela y la ineluctable modalidad de lo visible," in M. A. CASTIÑEIRAS (ed.), *Compostela y Europa. La historia de Diego Gelmírez*, Milano, 2010, pp. 260-299; *Id.*, "Flabellum: Ulises, la catedral de Santiago y la historia del arte medieval español como proyecto internacional," *Anales de Historia del Arte* (2011), pp. 281-316. On the liquid-like appearance of the Compostela shafts, R. SÁNCHEZ AMEJEIRAS, "Temática alegórica: escenas de vendimia y episodios legendarios," in *Santiago Punto de Encuentro. Catálogo de la exposición*, Santiago de Compostela, 2010, pp. 212-217.

³³ On the architectural appearance of the medieval façade see R. YZQUIERDO PERRÍN, "El Maestro Mateo y la terminación de la catedral románica de Santiago," in M. C. LACARRA DUCAY (ed.), *Los Caminos de Santiago. Arte, Historia y Literatura*, Zaragoza, 2005, pp. 253-284 where he summarizes his earlier publications on the subject. The reconstruction of the original staircase was made by J. A. PUENTE MIGUEZ, "La fachada exterior del Pórtico de la Gloria y el problema de sus accesos," in *Actas del simposio internacional sobre "O Pórtico da Gloria e a Arte do seu Tempo" (Santiago de Compostela 3-8 octubre de 1988)*, A Coruña, 1991, pp. 17-42. On the sculpted decoration of the façade see F. PRADO-VILAR, "Stupor et mirabilia: el imaginario escatológico del Maestro Mateo en el Pórtico de la Gloria," in P. L. HUERTA (ed.), *El Románico y sus mundos imaginados*, Aguilar de Campoo, 2014, pp. 181-204. The discovery, in 2015, of a new column figure which belonged, with all probability, to the outer façade of the Pórtico was the kick off for an exhibition held in the Museo del Prado and it was discussed together with other sculptures attributed to Mateo in its catalogue R. YZQUIERDO PEIRÓ (ed.), *Maestro Mateo en el Museo del Prado*, Madrid, 2016, with a comprehensive bibliography. New and innovative insights on the issue will be published in the forthcoming volume F. PRADO-VILAR (ed.), *El Pórtico de la Gloria. Arquitectura, materia y vision. The Portal of Glory. Architecture, Matter, and Vision*, especially in the text by Prado-Vilar "The Façade of the Portal of Glory," in pp. 53-132.



Fig. 6. Design of the canon José Vega y Verdugo representing the Western façade of the cathedral of Santiago de Compostela in the seventeenth century. (© Archivo y Biblioteca de la catedral de Santiago)

Not everybody could enjoy the Coming of the New Order: only a few, the archbishop, his entourage and his illustrious guests, had access to the tribune, where the near future was embodied in stone, the entire architectural structure transformed into the Heavenly City, the new building to come, figuratively illuminated by the Lamb (Rev. 21:23) that occupies the large boss in the vault.³⁴ The tribune, thus, constitutes in itself an image, and its location on the higher level, slightly narrower and higher than the tribunes of the naves, evokes the movement of the city that will descend from on high.

The calm, serene, sparse decoration of this space contrasts with the turmoil and tumultuous movement of the overcrowded lower levels, the ones intended for common mortals.

³⁴ For the identification of the tribune with the Heavenly Jerusalem, see S. MORALEJO ÁLVAREZ, "Esculturas compostelanas del último tercio del siglo XII," *Cuadernos de Estudios Gallegos*, 28 (1973), pp. 295-310, repr. A. FRANCO MATA (ed.), *Patrimonio Artístico de Galicia y otros estudios. Homenaje al Profesor Serafín Moralejo Álvarez*, 3 vols. Santiago de Compostela, 2004, I, pp. 47-56, esp. p. 51, n. 18; ID., "Notas para una revisión de la obra de J. K. Conant," in J. K. CONANT, *Arquitectura románica da catedral de Santiago de Compostela*, Santiago de Compostela, 1983, [Cambridge MA, 1926], pp. 221-236, repr. *Patrimonio Artístico de Galicia...*, I, pp. 247-63, esp. pp. 243-44; ID., "Le Porche de la Gloire," pp. 307-18, esp. pp. 307-08. Francisco Prado-Vilar expands the idea in "Aula Siderea: Architecture, Transfiguration, and Escatology in the Cathedral of Santiago," in F. PRADO-VILAR (ed.), *El Pórtico de la Gloria. Arquitectura, materia y vision. The Portal of Glory. Architecture, Matter, and Vision*, pp. 35-52 (forthcoming).

Nonetheless, the figurative structure of those levels is governed by the same vertical axis of descending movement.

As I have discussed elsewhere, common mortals had to content themselves with following the progression of the grand cosmic spectacle that would precede the coming of the Son of Man, conveyed as a sequential succession of extraordinary events displayed in two storeys.³⁵ The prophetic tradition shaped phenomena that challenged the conceptual and emotional distance between heaven and earth, and Master Mateo succeeded in displaying figurative discourses that linked two levels in order to create a dynamic of ascension and descent, enhanced by the mobile perception of the intended beholders.

On entering the crypt they would stand astonished contemplating the extraordinary circumstances that warn of the End of the earthly world. In Isaiah's prophecies, in St John's Apocalypse, in the medieval reworkings of the sibylline oracles and in the textual tradition of the *Iudicii signa* arbitrarily attributed to Jerome –texts that were well known in Compostela by the time–,³⁶ this subversion of the natural order affects the earth and the physical sky, and this dichotomy is embodied in the very structure of the building, for the disaster's earthly signs are displayed on the capitals of the so called "crypt". The textual tradition insists on including amongst these the bleeding of the plants,³⁷ and blood flows from the flowers of several Corinthian capitals and trickles into a chalice where two birds drink facing each other (Fig. 7a). Undoubtedly the sculptor departed from Eucharistic patterns, but he transformed them, stressing visually the streaming liquid, dissolving figuratively the solid materiality of granite. The same prophetic tradition also mentions the confusion of the terrified animals that is interpreted, at Compostela, as the rebellion



Fig. 7a. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. "Crypt". Capital. The bleeding of the plants. (©Museo de la catedral de Santiago)

³⁵ For a comprehensive discussion on the representation of the grand cosmic spectacle in the west end of Compostela cathedral see R. SÁNCHEZ AMEJEIRAS, "Dreams of Kings and Buildings: Galician imagery (1153-1230)," in *Culture and Society in Medieval Galicia. A Cultural Crossroad at the Edge of Europe*, J. D'EMILIO (ed. and trans.), Leyden, 2015, pp. 695-764, esp. pp. 727-22. In the present paper, focused on "rebellious architecture", I build up the argument on the firm grounds of earlier conclusions.

³⁶ SÁNCHEZ AMEJEIRAS, "Dreams of Kings and Buildings," p. 720.

³⁷ PETRUS DAMIANUS in his opusculus *De Novissimis et Antichristo*: "Omnia ligna silvarum, et olera herbarum sanguinem fluent rorem..." (PL 145cols. 840-842, esp. col 840); PETRUS COMESTOR, *Historia scholastica*, chap. XXLI, *De signis quindecim dierum ante iudicium*: "...herbae et arbores dabunt rorem sanguineum." (PL 198, col. 1611).

of domestic animals against their masters as can be seen in the capital at the entrance of the apse, where the feet of two riders are bitten by their own mounts (Fig. 7b).³⁸

The revolution will not only be earthly but also sidereal. The celestial bodies will fall. The alteration of the course of the celestial bodies is included among the signs announcing the End. Already in Isaiah 34:4 it is said:

And all the hosts of heavens shall be dissolved, and the heavens shall be rolled together as a scroll: and all their hosts shall fade away, as the leaf falleth from off the vine, and from the fig tree³⁹.

Matthew clarifies that:

Immediately after the tribulation of those days the sun will be darkened, and the moon will not give its light, and the stars will fall from heaven, and the powers of the heavens will be shaken (Mt, 24: 29).



Fig. 7b. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. "Crypt". Capital. The confusion of the animals. (© Museo de la catedral de Santiago)

³⁸ Petrus Comestor does not include the confusion and terror of the animals among the signs as Petrus Damianus and other authors do. See PETRUS DAMIANUS, *De Novissimis et Antichristo*: "*Signum duodecimi dei: Omnia animalia terrae de silvis et (sic) montibus venient ad campos rugientes et mugientes non gustantia et non bibentia.*" (PL 145, cols. 840-842).

³⁹ This biblical passage was visually epitomized in the figure of an angel rolling up the parchment of a starry sky in Last Judgment ensembles related to Byzantine traditions as in the mosaic of the western wall of Torcello cathedral. See R. SÁNCHEZ AMEJEIRAS, "If the Sea Were Made of Ink: a Word on Medieval Visual Poetry," 2020 (forthcoming). In this case, the notion of folding the parchment of the sky is stressed. Conversely, at Compostela, where the Last Judgement is not represented for earthly Time had not yet ended, the cosmic upheaval acquires a significant importance.

In the Book of Revelation, the cosmic revolution is alluded to on several occasions. Echoing Isaiah's vegetal simile which equated the fallen of leaves and the fall of stars, in Rev. 6: 12, 13 it is said that:

There was a great earthquake, and the sun became black as a sackcloth of hair; and the whole moon became as blood: And the stars from heaven fell upon earth, as the fig tree casteth its green figs when it is shaken by a great wind.

Later on, in Rev. 8:10-1, after the blowing of the third trumpet,

...a great star fell from heaven, blazing like a torch, and it fell on a third of the rivers and on the fountains of water. The name of the star is Wormwood (*absinthius*).

Non biblical texts, those belonging to the tradition of the *Iudicii Signa*, include, among them, the falling of the celestial bodies: from the more plain Latin versions,⁴⁰ to the more expressive words of the vernacular texts, like those of Berceo in his *Signos que aparecerán antes del Juicio Final*, where he picks up Isaiah's vegetal simile again: "They will see the stars fall from their realm/ as the leaves falling off from the fig-tree"/ "*Verán a las estrellas caer de so logar/ como caen las hojas quand caen del figar*".⁴¹

The vegetal simile echoes in the semantic ambiguity of the patterns used to represent the celestial bodies in the visual incarnation of these prophecies, both in Isaiah's announcement of the falling of the stars as rendered in the Bible Moralisée from Toledo (Toledo, cathedral of Toledo, MSS 1-3, fol. 118r),⁴² and in the illustrations of Spanish manuscripts of Beatus' Commentary on the Apocalypse where the falling of the stars is represented, as can be seen in



Fig. 8. Beato de Valcavado. The falling of the stars (Biblioteca histórica de Santa Cruz, Valladolid, cod. 433, fol. 98v).
(© Biblioteca histórica de Santa Cruz, Valladolid)

⁴⁰ Among others, PETRUS DAMIANUS, *De Novissimis et Antichristo*: "Errantia sidera, et stationaria spargent ex se igneas comas, qualiter in cometas apparet, orbi, et eius habitatoribus." (PL 145, cols. 840-842, esp. col. 40). PETRUS COMESTOR, *Historia scholastica*, chap. XXLI: "...duodecima cadent stellae." (PL, 198, col. 1611).

⁴¹ GONZALO DE BERCEO, *Signos que aparecerán antes del Juicio Final. Duelo de la Virgen. Martirio de San Lorenzo*, A. M. RAMONEDA (ed.), Madrid, 1980, p.134.

⁴² For this manuscript see LOWDEN, *Bibles Moralises*, pp. 95-137.

the Valcavado Beatus (Valladolid, Biblioteca Histórica de Santa Cruz, cod. 433, fol. 98v) (Fig. 8), and, occasionally, the falling of the Sun, for the star, named *absinthius* in Rev. 8: 10-11 is identified with the sun carried by an angel.⁴³

In Compostela, the sidereal catastrophe is not shaped through forms and colors on a two-dimensional surface, but embodied in the architectural elements of a three-dimensional setting. On the bosses, the sun and the moon are falling down from the heavens (Figs. 9a and 9b).⁴⁴ The figurative formulation is quite peculiar for angels take the place of personifications holding the celestial bodies. Furthermore, the way that they project downwards from the lower face of the keystone, their uncomfortable attitude and their unfolded wings symbolize their descending flight,⁴⁵ indicating that the natural course of the heavenly bodies has been



Fig. 9a. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. “Crypt”. Boss. The falling of the Sun. (Photo: Iganacio Mascuñán)

⁴³ For example, J. WILLIAMS, *The Illustrated Beatus: A Corpus of the Illustrations of the Commentary on the Apocalypse*, 5 vols, Turnhout (1999-2004), vol. IV (2002), pp. 15, 29, 178, figs. 25, 46, 84. Stars rendered as “rosettes” are to be found in a number of representations of the cosmic silence in this manuscript tradition as well, see F. PRADO-VILAR, “*Silentium*: el silencio cósmico como imagen en la Edad Media y la Modernidad,” *Revista de Poética Medieval*, 27 (2013), *Poéticas verbales, poéticas visuales*, R. SÁNCHEZ AMEJEIRAS (ed.), pp. 21-43.

⁴⁴ On the cosmic revolution in Biblical texts see E. ADAMS, *The Stars will Fall from Heavens. Cosmic Catastrophes in the New Testament and its World*, London, 2007, that, despite its title, includes Old Testament examples as well.

⁴⁵ The way the figures project downwards from the surface of the keystone is a significant feature. In his brilliant study on Early Gothic bosses Robert Branner addresses the different relationships between figurative motives and the structure of the keystone and considers them as mere technical variations, disregarding their semantic connotations.



Fig. 9b. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. "Crypt". The Falling of the Moon. (© Museo de la catedral de Santiago)

altered. Indeed, stars also fall from the top of the arches of the entrance, slowly sliding around their inner faces, as if they were snowflakes (Figs. 10a and 10b), a design which echoes the more theatrically orchestrated falling of the stars conveyed in the arches, ribs and bosses of the middle story (Fig. 11).⁴⁶

In fact, one of the striking features of the Compostela west end is the use of round bosses with sculptured decoration –the earliest ones preserved in the peninsula, as far as I know–, which astound by their notable size and, in the case of the middle story, by their technical

Branner's concern was double: reflecting on the connection between the iconography of the bosses and their location in the symbolic topography of the church and establishing a typology of bosses grounded on tectonic or even stereotomic reasons, see R. BRANNER, "Keystones and Kings. Iconography and Topography in the Gothic Vaults of the Ile-de-France," *Gazette des Beaux Arts*, 57 (1961), pp. 65-82.

⁴⁶ Serafín Moralejo noted years ago a kind of cross-referencing between the "luminous" bosses in the crypt and the tribune. MORALEJO ÁLVAREZ, "Esculturas compostelanas", p. 51, n. 18; ID., "Notas para una revisión," pp. 247-263, esp. p. 243-244; ID., "Le Porche de la Gloire," pp. 307-318, esp. pp. 307-308. I have expanded this relationship to those of the middle storey identifying the "vegetal" motifs with "luminous" decoration in "Dreams of Kings and Buildings," pp. 217-222. Moralejo, inspired by Conant's design of the elevation of the cathedral, disregarded both the peculiarities of the actual perception of the bosses in a three-dimensional space and the different nature of their intended audience. This fact explains why he perceived the bosses as decorated with static imagery. The identification of the "vegetal motifs" decorating arches, ribs and bosses on the vaults of the Pórtico with stars is also attested by later testimonies. The 14th century ceiling of the main chapel of the Dominican church of Bonaval at Compostela is clearly inspired in the Portico's although the protruding bosses are flattened there, transforming the cosmic upheaval into a serene starry sky; and last, but not least, during the restauration of the Pórtico a physical starry sky painted in the 16th century on the spandrels of the northern vault, showing the radial patterns we are today used to, came to light, demonstrating that the vaults and their decoration were understood in heavenly and not in vegetal terms.



Fig. 10a. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. "Crypt". Arch of the left entrance. Detail. The Falling of the Stars. Detail (Photo: Ignacio Mascuñán)

redundancy. The groin vaults did not need ribs and bosses, but the architect forced the design in order to imbricate them into the pre-existing structure.⁴⁷ Thus, groin vaults are deliberately disguised as ribbed vaults in order to "up-date" the ceiling, cross-referencing it with the vault of the crypt below, and to weave a holistic semantic discourse linking both levels.

As Michael Ward and Neil Stratford noted long time ago,⁴⁸ the direct ancestors of the Compostelan bosses are to be found in north Burgundy, where the earliest formulations of sculpted bosses can be found. Both classical and recent research on the abbey church of La Madeleine of Vézelay offers a clear chronological sequence of the experimental attempts to inhabit the vault of a building with figurative sculpture.⁴⁹ One of the earliest bosses at Vézelay, dating to the 1150s, was once located on the vault of the central tribune of the porch and it is preserved today, partially damaged, in the Musée Lapidaire of the abbey (Fig. 12a).⁵⁰ Although its decoration –with the two static seraphim rendered frontally– seems,

⁴⁷ Recently, several researchers have argued for the existence of an earlier crypt, as Conant had proposed – see CH. WATSON, *The Western Parts of the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela: A Reassessment*, Ph. D. Diss. University of Warwick, 1997; EAD., *The Romanesque Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela*, 2009; A. WUNDERBALD, "Una subestructura temprana con ropajes nuevos. La cripta occidental y su relación con el cuerpo occidental de la catedral de Santiago de Compostela," *Semata. Ciencias Sociales y Humanidades*, 22 (2010), pp. 369-390 and the contributions of Annette Munchmeyer, Bernd Nicolai and Henrik Karge in B. NICOLAI and K. REIDT (eds.), *Santiago de Compostela. Pilgerarchitektur und bildliche Repräsentation in neuer Perspektive*, Bern, 2015, where references to their earlier works on the subject can be found.

⁴⁸ M. L. WARD, *Studies on the Pórtico de la Gloria at the cathedral of Santiago de Compostela*, Ph. D. Diss., New York University, 1978; ID., "El Pórtico de la Gloria y la conclusión de la Catedral de Santiago de Compostela," in *Actas del simposio internacional "O Pórtico da Gloria e a Arte do seu Tempo" (Santiago de Compostela 3-8 octubre de 1988)*, A Coruña, 1991, pp. 43-52; N. STRATFORD, "Compostela and Burgundy? Thoughts on the Western crypt of the cathedral of Santiago," in *Actas del Simposio Internacional...*, pp. 53-82.

⁴⁹ A. TIMBERT, *Vézelay. Le chevet de la Madeleine et le premier gothique bourguignon*, Rennes, 2009; A. GAJEWSKI, "The Abbey Church at Vézelay and the Cult of Mary Magdalen: Invitation to a Journey of Discover," in Z. OPAČIĆ and A. TIMMERMANN (eds.), *Architecture, Liturgy and Identity. Liber Amicorum Paul Crossley*, Turnhout, 2011, pp. 221-240, with further bibliography.

⁵⁰ L. SAULNIER and N. STRATFORD, *La sculpture oubliée de Vézelay*, Genève and Paris, 1984, cat. n° 133, p. 104; TIMBERT, *Vézelay*, p. 49.



Fig. 10b. West end of Santiago de Compostela cathedral. "Crypt". Arch of the left entrance. The Falling of the Stars.
(Photo: Ignacio Mascuñán)



Fig. 11. Santiago de Compostela cathedral. Pórtico de la Gloria. Vault of the central bay. Stars falling from the ceiling.
(© Fundación Barrié)



Fig. 12a. Musée Lapidaire of the church of La Madeleine of Vézelay. Boss. Two Seraphim above a star.
(© Bildarchiv Photo Marburg)

at first sight, to fit with the well-established tradition which identified the ceiling with Heavenly metaphysical realms,⁵¹ the angels' disposition, emerging from behind a big central motif, compels us to reflect on the interpretation of the figurative discourses decorating the ceilings. Lydwine Saulnier and Neil Stratford described the central motif as a *couronne ... de feuilles d'acanthes*,⁵² an interpretation that relies, ultimately, upon the *feuilles largement refeuillés* portrayed by Violet-le-Duc a century earlier⁵³. Also Robert Branner characterized as "floral ornaments" –of astonishing disproportionate size, it must be said– the central motives of some bosses on the ceiling of the ambulatory of the church of Notre Dame of Étampes where angels and kings are displayed radially behind those "vegetal elements" which, Branner says, are usually found in the lower face of the bosses, the "natural focal point of the vault".⁵⁴ I do think that all this seems too vegetal. Did the monks of Vézelay or the canons of Étampes envisage the ceiling of their churches as well-stocked "natural" gardens

as modern art historians do? Given the semantic ambivalence of this kind of radial figurative pattern which runs from the vegetal world to the celestial one, the second option would fit better with their disposition on high⁵⁵. If this is so, in the Vézelay boss, the radial pattern repre-

⁵¹ By the same dates, the bosses that originally decorated the ceiling of the now lost main chapel of Laon cathedral showed an unequivocal metaphysical character, for Christ and the Lamb of God were carved on the very architectural junction without being hidden by an alleged vegetal decoration as happens at Vézelay, see I. KASARKA, "Le décor sculpté figuré du chœur primitif de la cathédrale de Laon (vers 1155): vestige d'une chapelle d'axe," *Histoire de L'Art*, 57 (October 2005), pp. 43-53, esp. pp. 48-50, figs. 3 and 4. The disposition of both bosses over the sanctuary would explain the visionary and liturgical character of their figurative decoration. A fairly similar solution is found at the ambulatory and the presbytery of Noyon cathedral, see *Ibidem*, p. 50.

⁵² SAULNIER and STRATFORD, *La sculpture oubliée*, cat. n° 133, p. 104; TIMBERT, *Vézelay*, p.49 also describes it as a *couronne d'acanthé*.

⁵³ *Dictionnaire raisonné de l'architecture française du XI au XVI siècle*, reprint. Ligugé, 1997, 3 vols., III, pp. 259-260, art. "clef".

⁵⁴ BRANNER, "Keystones and Kings," esp. p. 67, figs. 1 and 2.

⁵⁵ Not only on bosses displayed on high but also on archivolts or arches decorated with heavenly imagery. The case of the main portal of Saint Philibert of Charlieu is especially eloquent in this sense. While vegetal decoration is displayed on the inner archivolt framing the apocalyptic vision of the Majesty, on the outer archivolt the rosettes/stars provide the apocalyptic vision of the Elders and the Lamb (Rev., 4-5) with a cosmic dimension.

sents a star of noticeable size, so transforming the ceiling of the porch into something physical and luminous; the metaphysical reality symbolised by the seraphim being concealed behind the physical starry sky. And that would have also been the case at Étampes, where kings and angels are, accordingly, situated above the starry physical sky in the irregular ambulatory of the church.⁵⁶

While at the end of the 12th century the works of the west end of Compostela cathedral were in progress, new ventures were undertaken in the chapels of Vézelay's intriguing chevet.⁵⁷ There are no traces of metaphysical reality on the figurative decoration of the bosses displayed there (Fig. 12b). Thus, the vault is identified with the physical sky, as at Santiago. Compare, for example, the "vegetal/star" pattern on the keystone of the fourth chapel of the



Fig. 12b. Church of La Madeleine of Vézelay. Fourth chapel of the north side of the ambulatory. Boss. A star.
(© Bildarchiv Photo Marburg)

⁵⁶ There is no lack of other examples of meaningful "vegetal decoration". Ittai Weinrib has argued that vegetal scrolls were understood in medieval visual discourses on Genesis as images of the potential quality of formless matter, see I. WEINRIB, "Living Matter: Materiality, Maker and Ornament in the Middle Ages," *Gesta*, 52/2 (2013), pp. 113-32, and *Id.*, *The Bronze Object in the Middle Ages*, Cambridge, 2016, pp. 55-85.

⁵⁷ Later, in the 1160's, more complex solutions were tested in the so-called "chapter house", a space much restored by Viollet-le Duc. Even so, he respected the original plan where the six round bosses crowning the correspondent bays of the building, are surrounded by four roundels embedded symmetrically in the masonry, an innovation whose only known succession is to be found in Ourense cathedral. The analysis of this interesting ensemble will prove very useful for the subjects discussed here but it exceeds the limits of this contribution. On the bosses of Vézelay chapterhouse see SAULNIER and STRATFORD, *La sculpture oubliée*, p. 152, pls. 118-121.



Fig. 12c. Church of La Madeleine of Vézelay. Axial chapel of the chevet. Boss. River of Paradise.
(© Bildarchiv Photo Marburg)

north side of the Burgundian chevet, with the ones of the entrance of the “crypt” at Santiago (see Figs. 10b and 12b).⁵⁸ But, whereas at Vézelay the stars are literally and figuratively “fixed” to the physical sky, at Compostela they fall following the rhythm imposed by the structure of the arches in the “crypt”, or they drop from the ceiling of the Pórtico. Indeed, this illusion is stressed in the central bay boss: where the star/pineapple pattern of the ribs is transformed so that it seems to be expanding and trickling down, as if it were a stalactite (see Fig. 11).

The idea that something could figuratively drop from the vault of a building, expressed in sculptural terms, also finds its parallel in the Vézelay chévet, in a visionary context. For in the main chapel of the ambulatory seems to be raining (Fig. 12c). On its little keystone, encircled by an undulating vegetal frame, a personification of an apocalyptic river of Paradise is pouring water from the jar he holds. The transparent vessel allows a glimpse of the spiraling course of the water that ends in a copious stream of stone bubbles gushing down⁵⁹.

It has been argued that the other three rivers must have been painted on the vault masonry, and that would not be so odd, for precedents exist for painted rainy vaults. On the St. Clement Chapel in the church of Saint-Chef et Saint-Théodère-en-Dauphiné, dated to the first third of the twelfth century, the water of the pitchers held by the personifications of the Rivers of Paradise flows into the springers of the vault,⁶⁰ as it did, earlier, at the end of the eleventh century, on the vault that shelters the baptismal baldachin at San Pietro al Monte in Civate in

⁵⁸ SAULNIER and STRATFORD, *La sculpture oubliée*, p. 135 figs. 100; TIMBERT, *Vézelay*, pp. 157-158, other bosses in figs. 128, 129 and 130. Although Timbert saw vegetal decoration on those bosses he had already noticed the deliberate intention to create a unified discourse in the series of vaults of the ambulatory chapels.

⁵⁹ W. SAUERLÄNDER, *La Sculpture Gothique en France*, p. 104, fig. 46; SAULNIER and STRATFORD, *La sculpture oubliée*, p. 135, pl. 100; TIMBERT, *Vézelay*, p. 158, fig. 127.

⁶⁰ For Saint-Chef see B. FRANZÉ, “Du texte à l’image ou de l’image au texte. Réflexions autour de quelques peintures murales des xie et xiiie siècles,” in D. IOGNA-PRAT, M. LAWERS, F. MAZEL and J. ROSE (eds.), *Cluny: les moines et la société au premier âge féodal (800-1050)*, Rennes, 2013, pp. 209-212, esp. pp 212-213, and EAD., *La pierre et l’image. L’église de Saint-Chef-en-Dauphiné (Isère)*, Paris, 2011.

Lombardy, where water, after trickling down the spiraling “liquid” columns reaches the earth (Fig. 13).⁶¹ In both cases, the ceiling crowns a baptismal space,⁶² and the radial disposition of the figures creates the illusion that water springs from the painted bosses, where Christ and the Holy Spirit dwell symbolized respectively by the Christon at Civate and by a Dove at Saint-Chef, so conveying the divine power of the sacrament which emanates, ultimately, from God.⁶³

At Saint-Chef and Civate baptismal water is pouring figuratively from the ceiling and at Vézelay the purifying allusion can be understood in the frame of the hagiographic construction around the figure of Mary Magdalene shaped by the monks of the abbey that, as Alexandra Gajeswski has masterly analyzed, echoes in the design and the perception of the church.⁶⁴ However, the images decorating these three visionary vaults contradict the function of the ceiling where they are painted, i.e. to protect the covered area from, among other things, inclement weather.

At Civate, Saint-Chef and Vézelay it is raining purifying water from the vault, but, at Compostela, it is raining petals of stars. Following the natural order of Nature created by God,



Fig. 13. San Pietro al Monte in Civate. Vault of the baptismal baldachin. Rivers of Paradise. (Photo: Courtesy of Wikimedia Commons)

⁶¹ For Civate, see M. E. MÜLLER, *Omnia in mensura et numero et pondere disposita. Die Wandmalerei und Stuckarbeiten von San Pietro al Monte di Civate*, Regensburg, 2009. The paintings were recently restored, see G. LUZZANA, *I monumenti dell'abbazia di Civate alla luce del restauro*, Annone, 2015.

⁶² Barbara Franzé, taking into consideration the decoration of the ceiling, suggested that the chapel housed the baptismal font, FRANZÉ, “Du texte à l’image,” pp. 212-213. In fact, north apses in Romanesque churches usually functioned as baptisteries.

⁶³ The divine origin of the sacrament was stressed in several exegetical writings. If Ambrose Aupert states that the source of baptismal water is the Trinity or the Holy Spirit, Ambrose of Milan identifies it with Christ or God the Father, see FRANZÉ, “Du texte à l’image,” p. 212.

⁶⁴ GAJEWSKI, “Vézelay,” *passim*.

water falls from the high when it is raining, so visual metaphors alluding to watery ceilings fitted especially well with the idea of pouring the purifying sacramental water, even if they confronted the architectonic support where they were fashioned. The falling of the stars, in contrast, is one of the phenomena that will break the natural order by announcing the End of Time. The falling of the stars will break the natural order, just as making round bosses figuratively drop from a ceiling breaks the artificial order, the architect's symbolic order. The images of the falling sun and moon in the crypt of Santiago and the stars in the ceiling of the Pórtico contradict the function of the boss, the keystone, the architectonic device that was conceived to block, secure and joint the vault. Also the falling stars of the arches of the crypt go against the vertical thrust that the supporting architectonic elements are intended to convey.

As has been said the *superliminaria* of the Pórtico moved so much "at the voice of him that cried" that they broke. The premonitory text of Isaiah evoked in Compostela compels us to reflect on the sound of the Pórtico. As Thomas Connolly has demonstrated decades ago, the twenty-four Elders in the surrounding arch of the central entrance are tuning their instruments before the Heavenly concert commences (Fig. 14a).⁶⁵ Although a triumphant Christ descends from Heaven escorted by a multitude of angels and gives his blessing from the tympanum, He has not yet reached the earth, enthroned, as He is, above the lintels of the main door. Time, earthly time has not yet Ended. The cosmic revolution that will announce it has not arrived to an End either. On the capitals, domestic animals rebel against their masters with more violence than they did in the "crypt", and the last stars are raining from the vaults. Indeed, other signs of the End can be recognized there. The cosmic revolution will also condition the tidal rhythm. The sea will rise to an unnaturally high tide before immediately descending to an invisible depth, a phenomenon envisioned with architectonic metaphors in medieval texts –"the sea turning into a stone wall"– and echoed in the ascending/descending spirals of the frozen-sea marble columns of the Pórtico.⁶⁶ And last, but not least, men will be resurrected just before the Judge arrives, and a resurrected man climbs from his tomb on one of these columns.⁶⁷

All this revolution has its own soundtrack. To the uncomfortable sound of the tuning before the concert must be added the roar of the trumpets which the angels blow perched at the vault springers in the corner of the lateral walls (Fig. 14b). They blow them in a very peculiar way. They direct their sound towards the walls, as if they were the Jewish priests who, sounding their trumpets made the walls of Jericho collapse.

⁶⁵ T. H. CONNOLLY, "The Tuning of Heaven: The Aesthetic of the Pórtico de la Gloria," in J. LÓPEZ-CALO and C. VILLANUEVA (eds.), *El Códice Calixtino y la música de su tiempo. Actas del Simposio organizado por la Fundación Pedro Barrié de la Maza en A Coruña y Santiago de Compostela, 20-23 de septiembre de 1999*, A Coruña, 2001, pp. 95-110.

⁶⁶ PETRUS DAMIANUS in his opusculus *De Novissimis Et Antichristo*, PL 145, cols. 840-842, esp. col 840 describes the first sign with these words: "*María omnia in altitudem exaltabatur quindecim cubitorum supra montes excelsos orbis terrae, non affluentia, sed sicut muri aequora stabantur...*," and the second, "...*omni aequora prosternentur in imum profundi*." PETRUS COMESTOR in his *Historia scholastica*, chap. XXLI: "*Prima die eriget se mare quadraginta cubitis super altitudinem montium stans in loco suo quasi murus. Secunda tantum descendet, ut vix posset videri*," (PL 198, col. 1611).

⁶⁷ PETRUS DAMIANUS, *De Novissimis et Antichristo*: "*Omnia ab ortu solis sepulchra usque ad occisum patebunt, cadaveris surgentibus, usque ad horam iudicii*." (PL 145, cols. 840-842, esp. col. 840). PETRUS COMESTOR, *Historia Scholastica*, chap. XXLI: "... *undecima surgent ossa mortuorum, et stabunt super sepulchra; ...tredecima morientur viventes, ut cum mortuis resurgant;...*" (PL 198, col. 1611).



Fig. 14a. Santiago de Compostela cathedral. Pórtico de la Gloria. (Photo: Denis E. F. © Fundación Catedral de Santiago)



Fig. 14b. Santiago de Compostela cathedral. Pórtico de la Gloria. Angel blowing the trumpet against the wall. (Photo: author)

Curiously enough, another harbinger of the End will be the breaking of the stones that will be the prelude to a devastating earthquake.⁶⁸ If the angels blowing the trumpets against the walls could trigger the memory of Jericho in the mind of the beholder - who could imagine how the walls of the Pórtico would collapse –other images would make them feel that the earth moved under their feet. Two souls –possibly awaiting damnation– who take refuge in an angel's bosom in the southern arch appear to experience vertigo as they look downwards (see Fig. 14a). They try desperately not to fall down, as if the floor of the porch were the Mouth

⁶⁸ PETRUS DAMIANUS, *De Novissimis et Antichristo*: "*Signum octavi dei: Terremotus erit magnus, ita ut nullus homo stare possit, aut nullum animal, sed solo sternerentur omnia. Signum noni die: Omnes lapides tam parvis quam magnis scinduntur in quatuor partes, et unaquaque pars collidet alteram partem, nescietque ullus homo sonum illum, nisi solus Deus...Signum undecimi die: Omnes montes, et colles, et omnia aedificia humana arte constructa, in pulvere rediguntur.*" (PL 145, cols. 840-842, cols. 840). PETRUS COMESTOR, *Historia Scholastica*, chap. XXLI: "... sexta ruent aedificia; septima petrae ad invicem collidentur; octava fiet generalis terrae motus." (PL 198, col. 1611).



Fig. 15. Museo de la catedral de Santiago de Compostela. Reconstruction of the rose-window originally crowning the south entrance of the Pórtico de la Gloria. (Photo: Museo de la catedral de Santiago)

or the cauldron of Hell, incorporating it into the storyline. Thus, figuratively, the stones break on the floor of the southern bay. Indeed, they disintegrate—as the physical holes show—in the enormous gaping jaws of the lions of Daniel (?) that grip the socle of the *trumeau* of the Pórtico (see Fig. 2). And stones also break in the outer wall, pierced as it was, by a number of rose windows that would also have astonished the viewers by their illusory movement (see Fig. 6). As Helen Dow demonstrated years ago, the term rose-windows is a translation of the term *rose* coined by nineteenth-century French art historians, who were inclined to understand medieval buildings in vegetal terms. But in the Middle Ages they were described as *rotæ*, as wheels, and the word conditioned its design and its perception.⁶⁹ Rose windows like the one that presides over the façade of the south transept of Saint-Étienne de Beauvais—or the West

⁶⁹ H. J. Dow, "The Rose Window," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 20 (1957), pp. 248-297; H. KESSLER, "From *Vanitas* to *Veritas*: the Profane as the Fifth Mode of Romanesque Art," *Codex Aquilarensis*, 33 (2017), pp. 27-54, esp. 35-36 provides with further bibliography on rose windows identified as *rotæ*. On architectonic metaphors related to windows see also R. SÁNCHEZ AMEJEIRAS, "A través de la ventana: metáforas arquitectónicas y arte 1200 en Castilla y León," in R. ALCOY (ed.), *Contextos 1200 y 1400. Arte de Cataluña y de la Europa meridional en dos cambios de Siglo*, Barcelona, 2012, pp. 213-228.

front of Basel cathedral or Saint Zeno in Verona— transforms itself into the allegorical Wheel of Fortune governing the unequal fate of the characters, climbing up or plunging down from the top. The Wheels of the Santiago rose window corresponding to the lower level of the left entrance, reconstructed with the extant fragments preserved at the Museo de la Catedral are but the physical Wheels of Heaven, the *rotae coeli* which Isidore describes in his *Etymologies*, that spin populated with planets (Fig. 15).⁷⁰ On seeing the harmonious movement of the celestial bodies in the balanced structure of the façade the viewers would hardly imagine the cosmic and architectonic revolutions that were taking place inside the building.

Shivering posts, walking columns, dissolving shafts, restless socles, rainy ceilings, falling bosses, sliced open floors and pierced walls shape an architectonic vocabulary that fitted especially well with visionary discourses. The scalloping profiles of the jambs on the southern portal of Moissac echoes the shivering posts of the Temple of Isaiah's vision. The personifications of the apocalyptic rivers of Paradise pouring water from the spring vaults or from the bosses at Civate, Saint-Chef and Vézelay transubstantiates the masonry of the ceilings into water bringing to earth St John's vision of the Garden of the Heavenly City, and at Compostela the cosmic revolution which announces the End of Time according to several prophetic traditions is incarnated in a three-dimensional scenery linking three stories together, where the alteration of the natural order is conveyed by subverting long-running traditions related to the symbolism of architectonic elements. Natural disorders and "rebellious architectures" seem to be significant devices of what has been defined as the visionary mode.

⁷⁰ KESSLER, in "From *Vanitas* to *Veritas*", pp. 27-54, esp. 35-36 expands the symbolic connotations of the rose windows, for example, identifying the radial pattern of the rose of the façade of San Pietro in Tuscania with a sidereal Christ-Sun.

